

REPUBLIC OF SOUTH AFRICA

MINUTES OF PROCEEDINGS

OF

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

TUESDAY, 17 MARCH 2015

1. The House met at 14:00.
2. The Deputy Speaker took the Chair and requested members to observe a moment of silence for prayer or meditation.
3. [14:01] Notices of motion.
4. [14:10] Mr M L Shelembe moved without notice: That the House -
 - (1) notes that in 2007, the then Member of the Executive Council (MEC) for Social Development in KwaZulu-Natal turned the sod, to build a multi-purpose centre at the Ndaka municipality in the Uthukela District;
 - (2) further notes that the proposed centre would comprise of, *inter alia*, offices for the Department of Home Affairs, Department of Social Development, and the South African Social Security Agency (SASSA) which handles social grant payments;
 - (3) acknowledges that huge amounts of tax payer's hard earned income was used to transport people to the event, big marquee tents and sound systems were hired and professional artists and caterers were engaged to provide entertainment and cater for the event;
 - (4) further acknowledges that it is more than eight years ago that the promise of the multi-purpose centre was made to the community and to date it remains unfulfilled;
 - (5) recognises that the people of Umhlumayo and surrounding areas are still experiencing difficulties in accessing the services of the Departments of Home Affairs and Social Development as well as the services of the SASSA;

- (6) expresses its dissatisfaction in the delay of building the multi-purpose centre at Ndaka to facilitate much needed social services to the community; and
- (7) urges the KwaZulu-Natal MEC for Social Development to proceed with the construction and completion of the proposed multi-purpose centre as a matter of high priority.

Agreed to.

5. Mr A M Mpontshane moved without notice: That the House –

- (1) notes with sadness the untimely death of Mr Baltassar Mbhasobheni Xolani Skhakhane, who passed away on Friday, 6 March 2015, at the age of 44;
- (2) further notes that Mr Skhakhane was a member of the National Teacher's Union (NATU), and he also served on the Central Executive Board as the Vice President from 2009 until his passing;
- (3) acknowledges that he became the National Teacher's Union secretary for the Umtshezi Branch and Secretary for the Escort Region, and that he contributed immensely to the development of both Umsinga High School, where he was a school teacher, and Usizo High School where he was the principal; and
- (4) extends its deepest condolences for the tragic loss of Mr Skhakhane to his family, especially his wife and children, his union and to his community that he served with dedication.

Agreed to.

6. Mr P G Atkinson moved without notice: That the House –

- (1) notes the recent passing of Mrs Moira Winslow, the former Chairperson of the Drive Alive Road Safety Campaign, and expresses its gratitude for the immense contribution she made to the cause of road safety in South Africa;
- (2) further notes that on 24 March 1985, Moira Winslow's 28 year old daughter, 13 year old son and her two grandchildren were killed in a tragic collision on the road to Polokwane;
- (3) acknowledges that this tragic loss of her children and grandchildren motivated Mrs Winslow to set up the Drive Alive campaign to educate school children on all aspects of road safety;
- (4) recalls that the Drive Alive Drama Group performed a play in schools all over South Africa to educate South African school children about the importance of road safety for drivers and pedestrians;

- (5) further recalls that between 2008 and 2009 the Drive Alive Drama Group performed at 201 Primary Schools in Soweto and taught 94000 Soweto school children all aspects of road safety;
- (6) further acknowledges the tragic death this weekend of Minister Collins Chabane and his bodyguards on the same stretch of road that killed Mrs Winslow's children almost 30 years ago, and that so much more still needs to be done to improve road safety in South Africa; and
- (7) expresses its deep condolences to the Winslow family on the passing of Moira and its deep gratitude for all that she did to try and make South Africa's roads a safer place.

Agreed to.

7. Mr M U Kalako moved without notice: That the House –

- (1) notes that every year 25 March is regarded as the International Day of Remembrance of the Victims of Slavery and the Transatlantic Slave Trade;
- (2) further notes that this year's theme is *Women and Slavery*, pays tribute to the many enslaved women who endured unbearable hardships, including sexual exploitation, as well as those who fought for freedom from slavery and advocated for its abolition;
- (3) remembers that for over 400 years, more than 15 million men, women and children were the victims of the tragic transatlantic slave trade, one of the darkest chapters in human history;
- (4) understands that this day offers us the opportunity to honour and remember those who suffered and died at the hands of the brutal slavery system;
- (5) recognises that this day also aims to raise awareness about the dangers of racism and prejudice today; and
- (6) calls upon civil society, Government, religious formations and Parliament to commemorate this day, also in support of struggles against the new form of slavery, human trafficking, which affects women and children.

Agreed to.

8. Dr W G James moved without notice: That the House –

- (1) notes that scientists at the California based Scripps Research Institute, have developed a genetically engineered antibody that, once in human blood, grabs hold of an infecting virus and deactivates it;
- (2) further notes that the breakthrough is possible because of work completed by the California Institute of Technology Nobel Laureate, David Baltimore, funded in part by Bill Gates, in what has become known as gene-replacement therapy;

- (3) acknowledges that the idea of turning a high-level science breakthrough into a therapy that can be applied on a mass scale came from the University of Pennsylvania virologist Philip Johnson;
- (4) further acknowledges that the successful translation of what is a monumental breakthrough in science has the potential of preventing viruses that cause AIDS, ebola, malaria, flu, hepatitis and other diseases; and
- (5) calls on the South African Government and the private sector to invest more in the development of our medical science community and create many more opportunities for them to benefit more fulsomely from discoveries made elsewhere.

Agreed to.

9. Mr M L W Filtane moved without notice: That the House –

- (1) notes that David Macgregor reported an incident of a water problem west of the city of East London and that residents have been reported to have been without water for, to date, nine days;
- (2) further notes that areas affected by this problem are: Tsholomnqa, Kayser's beach, and the surrounding rural villages;
- (3) recalls that Noreen Earl who is a retiree in Tsholomnqa said that "though they have been experiencing water shortages, this was the worst situation as in previous weeks the area did not have water";
- (4) calls on all the relevant authorities from all spheres of government to act decisively to solve this water problem; and
- (5) further calls for a probe to find out what has led to this water problem; and if there are authorities that did not perform their duties to prevent this they must face the law.

Agreed to.

10. Mr M S Mabika moved without notice: That the House –

- (1) notes that the South African national cricket team, the Proteas, have qualified to play in a quarter final knock-out match at the 2015 International Cricket Council (ICC) World Cup Tournament;
- (2) further notes that the Proteas secured a place in the quarter finals by beating the United Arab Emirates with an emphatic 146-run win on 12 March 2015;
- (3) recognises that the Proteas will face the national team of Sri Lanka;
- (4) further recognises that the game will start at 05:30am, South African time; and

- (5) wishes the Proteas success in their game and a convincing win over the team of Sri Lanka.

Agreed to.

11. Ms R M M Lesoma moved without notice: That the House –

- (1) welcomes the first penis transplant in the world by South African doctors, who successfully performed the operation on a young man who had his organ amputated after a botched circumcision ritual;
- (2) further notes the nine-hour transplant, which occurred in December last year, was part of a pilot study by Tygerberg Hospital in Cape Town and the University of Stellenbosch to help scores of initiates who either die or lose their penises in botched circumcisions each year;
- (3) recalls that the patient was 21 years old when his penis was amputated three years ago, after he developed severe complications due to a traditional circumcision as a rite of passage into manhood;
- (4) further recalls that, according to the doctors, another nine patients will receive penis transplants as part of the study, but it was not clear when the operations could be carried out;
- (5) believes the procedure could eventually be extended to men who have lost their penises to cancer or as a last resort for severe erectile dysfunction; and
- (6) congratulates the doctors of the Tygerberg Hospital and the University of Stellenbosch for raising the South African flag high.

Agreed to.

12. Mr A M Shaik Emam moved without notice: That the House –

- (1) notes that during the past weekend the Island State of Vanuatu, one of the world's poorest nations, bore the brunt of a destructive category 5 cyclone with wind speeds of up to 300 kilometres per hour which raged in the South Pacific Ocean;
- (2) further notes that President Baldwin Lonsdale is on record stating that the cyclone has destroyed all development of recent years in Vanuatu;
- (3) acknowledges that aid agencies are of the opinion that the cyclone, which has displaced almost 33 000 people, could be the worst ever disaster to affect the area;
- (4) further acknowledges that the President of Vanuatu has appealed for immediate international emergency aid to assist the disaster-stricken country to deal with the aftereffects of the cyclone;

- (5) extend its condolences to the Government of Vanuatu on the loss of life, displacement of people and destructive damage caused by the devastating cyclone; and
- (6) urges the South African Government and South African aid agencies to extend whatever aid can be released to assist the Vanuatu nation to rebuild their country.

Agreed to.

13. Mr A M Mpontshane moved without notice: That the House –

- (1) notes that 139 learners have taken both the national and KwaZulu-Natal education departments and the Minister of Basic Education, Angie Motshekga, to court;
- (2) further notes that this court action comes after no proper resolution to the matric exams cheating scandal was found, and the learners implicated, but not charged, were forced to put their lives on hold as their matric results were being withheld;
- (3) acknowledges that many of the learners are from poor and child-headed households, that they need the results to better their lives and that some of them, such as Thabo Mokoena, lost bursary opportunities because they did not have their results;
- (4) calls on both the national and KwaZulu-Natal education departments to finalise the investigation in order to clarify which learners are implicated in the cheating scandal and which are innocent, so that those who were not involved can receive their results and move on with their lives; and
- (5) further calls on both the national and KwaZulu-Natal education departments to assist those innocent learners who qualify to study, not only in finding space in tertiary institutions but also in obtaining bursaries so that they do not lose the opportunity to change their lives.

Agreed to.

14. Ms C N Majeke moved without notice: That the House –

- (1) notes that on 13 March, the *Mail and Guardian* newspaper reported on a new survey prepared by United Nations (UN) Women and the Inter Parliamentary Union;
- (2) further notes that according to the survey, South Africa comes in third with 15 of its 36 ministers being females; while Cape Verde comes in first place of African countries with the highest number of women occupying ministerial positions, with nearly half of its 17 ministers being females;

- (3) recognises the role of UN Women in their efforts in advancing women who can play a critical role in Africa's political sphere;
- (4) further recognises that a representative of the UN Women stated that "if today's leaders front load gender equality, we can look forward to gender equality by 2030 - despite gains, we can improve"; and
- (5) congratulates the South African Parliament for being a part of the front runners in promoting gender equality.

Agreed to.

15. Mr M U Kalako moved without notice: That the House –

- (1) notes that the former African National Congress (ANC) Member of Parliament and Chief Minister of then Gazankulu homeland, Chief Samuels Dickson Weller Nxumalo, died at his home in Magona, Limpopo on 7 March 2015;
- (2) further notes in 2010, Chief Magona made history by stepping down as Chief of the Magona area in favour of his son Busa Nxumalo who is the Chairman of the Vhembe House of Traditional Leaders;
- (3) recalls that he defied protestations by some of his colleagues, who wanted his Ximoko party to contest elections without partners;
- (4) acknowledges that he was a firm believer in the self-reliance and capabilities of the local community;
- (5) further acknowledges that he also introduced the concept of an "open door" policy and allowed everyone, from elites to the rank and file, to approach his office to discuss any issues; and
- (6) conveys its condolences to his family, friends and all the Magona people.

Agreed to.

16. [14:38] The Deputy Chief Whip of the Majority Party moved: That the House –

- (1) notes with sadness the untimely passing of member of Parliament and Minister of Public Service and Administration, Mr Collins Chabane, and his two protectors, Sergeants Lesiba Sekele and Lawrence Lentsoane, in a motor vehicle accident on Sunday, 15 March 2015;
- (2) recalls that Minister Chabane previously served as Minister in the Presidency responsible for performance monitoring and evaluation;
- (3) further recalls that he developed the new Department of Performance Monitoring and Evaluation within a short space of time, and was able to ensure that the monitoring and evaluation function became a crucial part of government work and was a distinct feature of the fourth administration;

- (4) acknowledges that he was a true servant of the people, who joined the struggle for liberation at a very young age and then went on to continue the fight in exile;
- (5) further acknowledges he was an ardent and passionate lover of the arts, having developed his love for music while in incarceration;
- (6) believes that through his premature and tragic passing, the nation has indeed lost a remarkable individual who served and led with kindness, great humility, humbleness, dedication and energy;
- (7) further believes his passing leaves a huge void within the ranks of government and the African National Congress, which he served with loyalty and selflessness for decades; and
- (8) extends its heartfelt condolences to the family and friends of Minister Chabane, Sergeant Sekele and Sergeant Lentsoane.

Debate concluded.

Agreed to, members standing.

17. [15:26] Members' statements.

18. FIRST ORDER [16:01]

Decision of Question on Second Reading – **Division of Revenue Bill [B 5 – 2015]** (National Assembly – sec 76).

There was no debate.

Question put: That the Bill be read a second time.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES - 234: Abrahams, B L; Adams, F; Adams, P E; Bam-Mugwanyanya, V; Bapela, K O; Basson, J V; Bekwa, S D; Beukman, F; Bhengu, P; Bhengu, F; Bhengu, N R; Bilankulu, N K; Bongo, B T; Bonhomme, T J; Booi, M S; Boroto, M G; Boshielo, S P; Brown, L; Buthelezi, M G; Capa, R N; Capa, N; Carrim, Y I; Cele, B H; Cele, M A; Chikunga, L S; Chiloane, T D; Chohan, F I; Chueu, M P; Coleman, E M; Cronin, J P; Cwele, S C; Davies, R H; Dirks, M A; Dlakude, D E; Dlamini-Dubazana, Z S; Dlodlo, A; Dlomo, B J; Dzulane, B N; Dunjwa, M L; Esterhuizen, J A; Filtane, M L W; Fubbs, J L; Galo, M P; Gamede, D D; Gcwabaza, N E; Gigaba, K M N; Gina, N; Godi, N T; Goqwana, M B; Gumede, D M; Hlengwa, M; Jafta, S M; Jeffery, J H; Joemat-Pettersson, T M; Johnson, M; Jonas, M H; Kalako, M U; Kekana, H B; Kekana, P S; Kekana, C D; Kekana, E; Kenye, T E; Khoarai, L P; Khosa, D H; Khoza, T Z M; Khoza, M B; Khubisa, N M; Khunou, N P; Koornhof, G W; Kota-Fredricks, Z A; Kubayi, M T; Kwankwa, N L S; Landers, L T; Lekota, M G P; Lesoma, R M M; Letsatsi-Duba, D B; Loliwe, F S; Luyenge, Z; Luzipo, S; Maake, J J; Mabasa, X; Mabe, B P; Mabe, P P; Mabija, L; Mabilo, S P; Mabudafhasi, T R; Madella, A F; Maesela, P; Mafolo, M V; Mafu, N N; Magadla, N W; Magadzi, D P; Magwanishe, G; Mahambehlala, T; Mahlangu, J L; Mahlangu, D G; Mahlobo, M D; Maila, M S A; Majeke, C N; Majola, F Z; Makhubela-Mashele, L S; Makhubele, Z S; Makondo, T; Makwetla, S P; Malgas, H H; Maluleke, J M; Manana, D P;

Manana, M N S; Manana, M C; Mantashe, P T; Maphatsoe, E R K; Mapulane, M P; Martins, B A D; Masango, M S A; Masehela, E K M; Mashatile, S P; Mashego-Dlamini, K C; Mashile, B L; Masina, M C; Masondo, N A; Masuku, M B; Masutha, T M; Mathale, C C; Mathebe, D H; Matlala, M H; Matshoba, M O; Matsimbi, C; Mavunda, R T; Maxegwana, C H M; Mbete, B; Mchunu, S; Mdakane, M R; Mfeketo, N C; Mjobo, L N; Mkhize, H B; Mmemezi, H M Z; Mmola, M P; Mmusi, S G; Mncwango, M A; Mnganga - Gcabashe, L A; Mnguni, P J; Mnguni, D; Mnisi, N A; Mogotsi, V P; Mokoto, N R; Molebatsi, M A; Molewa, B E E; Moloi-Moropa, J C; Morutoa, M R; Mosala, I; Mothapo, M R M; Motimele, M S; Motshekga, M A; Motshekga, M S; Mpontshane, A M; Mpumlwana, L K B; Msimang, C T; Mthembu, N; Mthembu, J M; Mthethwa, E N; Mthethwa, E M; Mudau, A M; Muthambi, A F; Nchabeleng, M E; Ndaba, C N; Ndabeni-Abrahams, S T; Ndongeni, N; Nel, A C; Nene, N M; Nesi, B A; Ngcobo, B T; Ngwenya-Mabila, P C; Nkadimeng, M F; Nkomo, S J; Nkwinti, G E; Nobanda, G N; November, N T; Ntombela, M L D; Ntshayisa, L M; Nxesi, T W; Nyalungu, R E; Nyambi, H V; Oliphant, G G; Oosthuizen, G C; Patel, E; Peters, E D; Phaahla, M J; Phosa, Y N; Pikinini, I A; Pilane-Majake, M C C; Plouamma, M A; Qikani, A D N; Radebe, B A; Radebe, J T; Radebe, G S; Ralegoma, S M; Ramatlakane, L; Ramokhoase, T R J E; Rantho, D Z; Raphuti, D D; Scheepers, M A; Semenya, M R; September, C C; Shaik Emam, A M; Shope-Sithole, S C N; Sibande, M P; Sisulu, L N; Sithole, K P; Siwela, E K; Sizani, P S; Skosana, J J; Skwatsha, M; Smith, V G; Soty, M M; Surty, M E; Thomson, B; Tleane, S A; Tobias, T V; Tom, X S; Tongwane, T M A; Tseke, G K; Tseli, R M; Tsenoli, S L; Tsoleli, S P; Tsotetsi, D R; v R Koornhof, N J J; Van Der Merwe, L L; Van Rooyen, D D D; Van Schalkwyk, S R; Williams, A J; Xasa, T; Xego-Sovita, S T; Yengeni, L E; Zokwana, S.

NOES - 99: Alberts, A; America, D; Atkinson, P G; Bagraim, M; Baker, T E; Balindlela, Z B N; Basson, L J; Bergman, D; Bhanga, B M; Boshoff, H S; Bozzoli, B; Brauteseth, T J; Breytenbach, G; Cardo, M J; Cassim, Y; Chance, R W T; Davis, G R; De Freitas, M S F; De Kock, K; Dreyer, A M; Dudley, C; Esau, S; Figg, M J; Figlan, A M; Gana, S M; George, D T; Gqada, T; Groenewald, P J; Hadebe, T Z; Hill-Lewis, G G; Hoosen, M H; Horn, W; Hunsinger, C H H; James, L V; James, W G; Jongbloed, Z; Joseph, B D; Ketabahle, V; Kohler, D; Kruger, H C C; Krumbock, G R; Lees, R A; Lorimer, J R B; Lotriet, A; Louw, E N; Lovemore, A T; Mackay, G; Madisha, W M; Maimane, M A; Majola, T R; Malatsi, M S; Malema, J S; Marais, E J; Marais, S J F; Masango, S J; Mashabela, N R; Matiase, N S; Maxon, H O; Maynier, D J; Mazzone, N W A; Mbatha, M S; Mbhele, Z N; Mc Gluwa, J J; Mcloughlin, A R; Meshoe, K R J; Mhlongo, T W; Mileham, K J; Morapela, K Z; Motau, S C; Moteka, P G; Mubu, K S; Mulaudzi, T E; Mulder, C P; Mulder, P W A; Ndlozi, M Q; Ollis, I M; Redelinghuys, M H; Robinson, D; Schmidt, H C; Selfe, J; Shinn, M R; Stander, T; Steenhuisen, J H; Steenkamp, J; Steyn, A; Stubbe, D J; Swart, S N; Tarabella Marchesi, N I; Terblanche, J F; Van Dalen, P; Van Damme, P T; Van Der Walt, D; Van Der Westhuizen, A P; Van Dyk, V; Volmink, H C; Vos, J; Walters, T C R; Waters, M; Whitfield, A G.

Question agreed to.

Bill accordingly read a second time.

19. [16:12] The Leader of the Opposition moved: That the House –
- (1) notes that under the leadership of President J G Zuma –
 - (a) independent institutions of the state have been politicised and weakened;
 - (b) unemployment has escalated to unprecedented levels;
 - (c) the economy is at its weakest point in recent history;
 - (d) the right of access to quality education has been violated; and
 - (e) corruption has spiralled out of control; and
 - (2) resolves in terms of section 102(2) of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996, that it has no confidence in President J G Zuma.

Debate concluded.

Question put: That the motion by the Leader of the Opposition be agreed to.

Division demanded.

BUSINESS SUSPENDED DUE TO TECHNICAL ERROR AT 18:45 AND RESUMED AT 18:49.

The House divided.

AYES - 113: Alberts, A; America, D; Atkinson, P G; Bagraim, M; Baker, T E; Balindlela, Z B N; Basson, L J; Bergman, D; Bhanga, B M; Boshoff, H S; Bozzoli, B; Brauteseth, T J; Breytenbach, G; Cardo, M J; Carter, D; Cassim, Y; Chance, R W T; Davis, G R; De Freitas, M S F; De Kock, K; Dreyer, A M; Esau, S; Figg, M J; Figlan, A M; Filtane, M L W; Gana, S M; George, D T; Gqada, T; Groenewald, P J; Hadebe, T Z; Hill-Lewis, G G; Holomisa, B H; Hoosen, M H; Horn, W; Hunsinger, C H H; James, L V; James, W G; Jongbloed, Z; Joseph, B D; Ketabahle, V; Khubisa, N M; Kohler, D; Kopane, S P; Kruger, H C C; Krumbock, G R; Kwankwa, N L S; Lees, R A; Lekota, M G P; Lorimer, J R B; Lotriet, A; Louw, E N; Lovemore, A T; Mabika, M S; Mackay, G; Madisha, W M; Maimane, M A; Majeke, C N; Majola, T R; Malatsi, M S; Malema, J S; Marais, E J; Marais, S J F; Masango, S J; Mashabela, N R; Matiase, N S; Matsepe, C D; Maxon, H O; Maynier, D J; Mazzone, N W A; Mbatha, M S; Mbhele, Z N; Mc Gluwa, J J; Mcloughlin, A R; Mhlongo, T W; Mileham, K J; Mncwabe, S C; Morapela, K Z; Motau, S C; Moteka, P G; Mubu, K S; Mulaudzi, T E; Mulder, P W A; Mulder, C P; Ndlozi, M Q; Nqweniso, N V; Ollis, I M; Plouamma, M A; Redelinghuys, M H; Robinson, D; Ross, D C; Schmidt, H C; Selfe, J; Shelembe, M L; Shinn, M R; Sonti, N P; Stander, T; Steenhuisen, J H; Steenkamp, J; Steyn, A; Stubbe, D J; Swart, S N; Tarabella Marchesi, N I; Terblanche, J F; Van Dalen, P; Van Damme, P T; Van Der Walt, D; Van Der Westhuizen, A P; Van Dyk, V; Volmink, H C; Vos, J; Walters, T C R; Waters, M; Whitfield, A G.

NOES - 221: Abrahams, B L; Adams, F; Adams, P E; Bam-Mugwanya, V; Bapela, K O; Basson, J V; Bekwa, S D; Beukman, F; Bhengu, P; Bhengu, F; Bhengu, N R; Bilankulu, N K; Bongo, B T; Bonhomme, T J; Booii, M S; Boroto, M G; Boshielo, S P; Brown, L; Capa, R N; Capa, N; Carrim, Y I; Cele, B H; Cele, M A; Chikunga, L S; Chiloane, T D; Chohan, F I; Chueu, M P; Coleman, E M; Cronin, J P; Cwele, S C; Davies, R H; Dirks, M A;

Dlakude, D E; Dlamini-Dubazana, Z S; Dlodlo, A; Dlomo, B J; Dlulane, B N; Dunjwa, M L; Frolick, C T; Fubbs, J L; Galo, M P; Gamede, D D; Gcwabaza, N E; Gigaba, K M N; Gina, N; Godi, N T; Goqwana, M B; Gumede, D M; Jafta, S M; Jeffery, J H; Joemat-Pettersson, T M; Johnson, M; Jonas, M H; Kalako, M U; Kekana, H B; Kekana, P S; Kekana, C D; Kekana, E; Kekana, M D; Kenye, T E; Khoarai, L P; Khosa, D H; Khoza, T Z M; Khoza, M B; Khunou, N P; Koornhof, G W; Kota-Fredricks, Z A; Kubayi, M T; Landers, L T; Lesoma, R M M; Letsatsi-Duba, D B; Loliwe, F S; Luyenge, Z; Luzipo, S; Maake, J J; Mabasa, X; Mabe, B P; Mabe, P P; Mabija, L; Mabilo, S P; Mabudafhasi, T R; Madella, A F; Maesela, P; Mafolo, M V; Mafu, N N; Magadla, N W; Magadzi, D P; Magwanishe, G; Mahambehlala, T; Mahlangu, J L; Mahlangu, D G; Mahlobo, M D; Maila, M S A; Majola, F Z; Makhubela-Mashele, L S; Makhubele, Z S; Makondo, T; Makwetla, S P; Malgas, H H; Maluleke, J M; Manana, D P; Manana, M N S; Manana, M C; Mantashe, P T; Maphatsoe, E R K; Mapulane, M P; Martins, B A D; Masango, M S A; Masehela, E K M; Mashatile, S P; Mashego-Dlamini, K C; Mashile, B L; Masina, M C; Masondo, N A; Masuku, M B; Masutha, T M; Mathale, C C; Mathebe, D H; Matlala, M H; Matshoba, M O; Matsimbi, C; Mavunda, R T; Maxegwana, C H M; Mbalula, F A; Mchunu, S; Mdakane, M R; Mfeketo, N C; Mjobo, L N; Mkhize, H B; Mmemezi, H M Z; Mmola, M P; Mmusi, S G; Mnganga - Gcabashe, L A; Mnguni, P J; Mnguni, D; Mnisi, N A; Mogotsi, V P; Mokoto, N R; Molebatsi, M A; Molewa, B E E; Moloi-Moropa, J C; Morutoa, M R; Mosala, I; Mothapo, M R M; Motimele, M S; Motshekga, M A; Motshekga, M S; Mpumlwana, L K B; Mthembu, N; Mthembu, J M; Mthethwa, E N; Mthethwa, E M; Mudau, A M; Muthambi, A F; Nchabeleng, M E; Ndaba, C N; Ndabeni-Abrahams, S T; Ndongeni, N; Nel, A C; Nene, N M; Nesi, B A; Ngcobo, B T; Ngwenya-Mabila, P C; Nkadimeng, M F; Nkwinti, G E; Nobanda, G N; November, N T; Ntombela, M L D; Ntshayisa, L M; Nxesi, T W; Nyalungu, R E; Nyambi, H V; Nzimande, B E; Oliphant, G G; Oosthuizen, G C; Patel, E; Peters, E D; Phaahla, M J; Phosa, Y N; Pikinini, I A; Pilane-Majake, M C C; Qikani, A D N; Radebe, B A; Radebe, J T; Radebe, G S; Ralegoma, S M; Ramatlakane, L; Ramokhoase, T R J E; Rantho, D Z; Raphuti, D D; Scheepers, M A; Semanya, M R; September, C C; Shope-Sithole, S C N; Sibande, M P; Sisulu, L N; Siwela, E K; Sizani, P S; Skosana, J J; Skwatsha, M; Smith, V G; Soty, M M; Surty, M E; Thomson, B; Tleane, S A; Tobias, T V; Tom, X S; Tongwane, T M A; Tseke, G K; Tseli, R M; Tsenoli, S L; Tsoleli, S P; Tsotetsi, D R; v R Koornhof, N J J; Van Rooyen, D D D; Van Schalkwyk, S R; Williams, A J; Xasa, T; Xego-Sovita, S T; Yengeni, L E; Zokwana, S.

ABSTAIN - 8: Buthelezi, M G; Esterhuizen, J A; Hlengwa, M; Mncwango, M A; Mpontshane, A M; Msimang, C T; Nkomo, S J; Sithole, K P.

Question not agreed to.

Motion accordingly negated.

20. The House adjourned at 18:54.

G MGIDLANA
Secretary to Parliament